DESIGN IN MENTAL HEALTH

a literature review of design thinking in UK and European mental health
The current financial challenges faced by UK National Health Services are drastically impacting mental health service provision. Innovative approaches to care have the potential to:

• improve service user experience

• respect the individual’s needs through collaborative endeavour

• re-design systems - positively impacting funding and resource issues

• inform service provision through the lived experience of service users, support networks, carers and staff
Our intention is to inform service users, providers, researchers and designers of:

- the benefits of diverse forms of engagement between service user and provider
- challenges in staff and public patient involvement in care service quality management, and design research
- the philosophical frameworks underpinning research methodologies and service provision, or lack of them
- gaps in the literature and directions for future research, education and service development
- There have been reviews of the design for health literature, but not the intersections between design and mental health. In doing so we support current NHS mandates citing parity of esteem.
The literature review aims to deliver a current picture of design thinking, methodology and practice being utilised or explored within the field of mental health.

- 2010-2016, UK or EU based
- literature identified from outside these parameters eg; USA, Australia, saved for future extended review

**Modeled on:**
FIRST APPROACH

- **Review of Library Databases**
  - based on coverage of design or mental health subject
  - interdisciplinary nature

- **Grey Literature**
  - databases and search locations

Sarah Kettley & Rachel Lucas

CADBE conference 13-14 June 2016
• search terms developed around the separate domains of **mental health** and **design**

• rigorous key word search – developed a final search string run across selected databases

• identifying those in scope – highly iterative process, facilitated by the following key question:

  ‘**Does the paper include description of design processes or thinking, alongside consideration of mental health or wellbeing issues, or refer to design methodology or practice within a mental health?**’
WHERE TO SEARCH

- Design or interdisciplinary
- Art Bibliographies Modern
- Design and Applied Art Index
- International Bibliography of Art
- British Humanities Index
WHERE TO SEARCH

- Mental health
- SCOPUS
- PsychINFO
- Web of Science
- IBSS
- PsychArticles
- ASSIA
WHERE TO SEARCH

- 'GREY' literature (unpublished) databases
  - OpenGrey
  - BASE
  - The Kingsfund
  - greylit.eu

- Extended search
  - Google and relevant conferences
  - Service Design Network (SDN-UK and Global)
CREATIVE THINKING!

- Engaging with the process
  - Incorporating ‘creative thinking’ approach to the search.
  - Mind maps to facilitate search.
  - Purging early thoughts and ideas onto paper, as in ‘design thinking’, generated search terms.
  - Awareness of any researcher bias – (eg humanistic stance) impacting use of language. Remain open to varied models.

Sarah Kettley & Rachel Lucas
CADBE conference 13-14 June 2016
• **Strategy for search**

- Words and combinations of words: capable of delivering on target material.

- Iterative process developed around both domains - (consultation with others could be included here).

- Issues of language identified, across domains, differing meaning eg- ‘person-centred’?
EMERGING SEARCH STRANDS

- Terms relating to:
  - Design methodology and practice
  - Creative engagement
  - Stakeholders
  - Mental health ‘experiential’
  - Mental health ‘medical model’, diagnostic.

Sarah Kettley & Rachel Lucas

CADBE conference 13-14 June 2016
• A grounded theory approach was taken to identify themes and sub-themes (Bryman 2013)

• Immersion within the data (Moustakas 1990) allowed for specific on target intersections to be located

• A development of Sanders (2008) ‘Framework for Design Research’ integrated philosophical frameworks later used to analyze the literature: behavioural, cognitive, relational/social and medical models
• **1731** total database returns before removal of duplicates

• **(179)** database results found to be within scope

+ 

• **(134)** results from IoSoft project expert review

• = **310** manually transferred to spreadsheet

**Title, abstract, keywords reviewed:**

• **151** found relating closely

**Full papers reviewed:**

• **130** found *accurately* on target

**GREY LITERATURE**

• Top 100 Google results (28) in scope (25) non-EU

• 71 further papers saved for review
Design thinking practices such as Service and Participatory Design, currently lack an awareness of:

- the larger mental health service provision landscape
- range of mental health challenges faced by service users
- the philosophical modalities underpinning different services
- the potential personal and ethical impact of working within this sector
The following theoretical models can extend frameworks of design research to fully support studies within this sector:

- Behavioural
- Relational/social
- Cognitive
- Medical model

- Technological developments and design of assistive digital devices for mental health emerged as the largest category of papers
- **User centred design effectively asks for a medical model** and engages in design for a diagnostic label or disorder
- Increasing interest in participatory art, craft and creative practice in mental health research
- Language can be very misleading
LIMITATIONS

- Time limited and manpower – therefore search boundaries applied - UK/Europe and post 2010.

- Grey literature gathered but not analysed.

- Analysis of modality in design for mental health ongoing.
This review suggests the following future research directions:

- Review of non-EU and Grey literature. (Australia in particular looks busy in terms of collaborative research in this area)
- Digital/tech developments designed for the person not the diagnosis?
- Growing interest in evidence-based outcomes re- creative practice and mental health ‘recovery’
- Service design concepts brought to wellbeing services with a view to expand involvement including NHS commissioning bodies
WILL BE AVAILABLE FROM THE INTERNET OF SOFT THINGS WEBSITE:

http://aninternetofsoftthings.com/

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS:
The authors would like to thank Nottingham Trent University’s Research Development Fund (UoA 34), Heather Parsonage from NTU library services, and the EPSRC ‘An Internet of Soft Things’ project (EP/L023601/1) for making this research possible.